

Series 4 solution of first order logic tutorial

Exercise 1 Solution :

First, we need to specify the vocabulary used (the domain of discourse). In our case, we will use the following vocabulary :

Constants :

log : It is the constant representing logic.

Variables :

x and y.

The unary predicates :

Stud(x) : means that "x" is a student.

Module(y) : means that "y" is a module.

The binary predicates :

like(x,y) : means that "x" likes "y".

gnote(x,y) : means that "x" got a good grade in "y".

Better(x,y) : means that "x" is better than "y".

Now we will model the sentences :

- 1- $\forall x(Stud(x) \rightarrow like(x, log))$
- 2- $\forall x \exists y((Stud(x) \wedge Module(y)) \rightarrow \neg like(x, y))$
- 3- $\forall x \forall y((Stud(x) \wedge gnote(x, log) \wedge Stud(y)) \rightarrow Better(x, y))$

Exercise 2 Solution :

1- The predicates are :

man(x) and mortal(x).

2- The sentences in predicate logic are :

a- $\forall x(man(x) \rightarrow mortal(x))$.

b- mortal(Socrate).

c- man(Socrate).

3- Yes, we can deduce statement "b" from "a" and "c".

Proof :

Intuitively, "Socrates" is an instance of "x", and since "Socrates" is a man ($man(Socrates) = true$) and $\forall x(man(x) \rightarrow mortal(x)) = true$ so "Socrate" is mortal that is, $mortal(Socrates) = true$.

We can also prove this using proof theory, that is, we need to prove that :

$\forall x(man(x) \rightarrow mortal(x)), man(Socrate) \vdash mortal(Socrate)$.

The proof is like this :

- 1- $\vdash \forall x(man(x) \rightarrow mortal(x))$ hyp1
- 2- $\vdash man(Socrate)$ hyp2
- 3- $\vdash \forall x(man(x) \rightarrow mortal(x)) \rightarrow (man(Socrate) \rightarrow mortal(Socrate))$ sch $\forall$
- 4- $\vdash man(Socrate) \rightarrow mortal(Socrate)$ mp 1,3
- 5- $\vdash mortal(Socrate)$ mp 2,4

Exercise 3 Solution :

- 1- $\forall x(\text{influenza}(x) \longrightarrow \text{take}(x, \text{Tamiflu}))$
- 2- $\forall x((\text{fever}(x) \wedge \text{cough}(x)) \longrightarrow \text{influenza}(x))$
- 3- $\forall x \forall t((\text{temp}(x, t) \wedge \text{sup}(t, 38)) \longrightarrow \text{fever}(x))$
- 4- $\text{cough}(\text{Mohamed}) \wedge \exists t(\text{temp}(\text{Mohamed}, t) \wedge \text{sup}(t, 38))$
- 5- $\text{take}(\text{Mohamed}, \text{Tamiflu})$

Exercise 4 Solution :

To answer this question, we need to construct the syntax trees of each formula.

After numbering the variables, we find :

$$F_1 : \forall x_4 \exists y_3 (\forall y_1 P(x_4, y_1) \rightarrow \exists x_2 Q(x_2, y_3)) \Rightarrow F_1 : \forall 4 \exists 3 (\forall 1 P(4, 1) \rightarrow \exists 2 Q(2, 3))$$

$$F_2 : \forall v_4 \exists z_3 (\forall u_1 P(z_3, u_1) \rightarrow \exists u_2 Q(u_2, v_4)) \Rightarrow F_2 : \forall 4 \exists 3 (\forall 1 P(3, 1) \rightarrow \exists 2 Q(2, 4))$$

$$F_4 : \forall z_4 \exists x_3 (\forall x_1 P(z_4, x_1) \rightarrow \exists z_2 Q(z_2, x_3)) \Rightarrow F_4 : \forall 4 \exists 3 (\forall 1 P(4, 1) \rightarrow \exists 2 Q(2, 3))$$

According to results, we observe that F_1 and F_3 are congruent.

Exercise 5 Solution :

-1 False, **2-** False, **3-** True, **4-** False, **5-** True, **6-** True, **7-** True, **8-** False.

For justification, for example, for the first one : $Q(c1) = \text{True}$ so $\neg Q(c1) = \text{False}$, $Q(c2) = \text{True}$ so $\neg Q(c2) = \text{False}$ and $Q(c3) = \text{True}$ so $\neg Q(c3) = \text{False}$. $I(\forall x \neg Q(x)) = I(\neg Q(c1) \wedge \neg Q(c2) \wedge \neg Q(c3)) = F \wedge F \wedge F = F$. We do the same for the other formulas.

Exercise 6 Solution :

a) The truth table of the first formula $\forall x(P(x) \longrightarrow \exists x Q(x))$ knowing that the domain $D = \{1, 2\}$.

- We will represent the predicate $P(x)$ by the function $f(x)$,
- The predicate $Q(x)$ will be represented by the function $g(x)$.

The truth table of $P(x)$ is as follows :

x	$P(x)$	$f_1(x)$	$f_2(x)$	$f_3(x)$	$f_4(x)$
1		T	T	F	F
2		T	F	T	F

The truth table of $Q(x)$ is as follows :

x	$Q(x)$	$g_1(x)$	$g_2(x)$	$g_3(x)$	$g_4(x)$
1		T	T	F	F
2		T	F	T	F

Since there are no free variables in the formula, the overall truth table is as follows :

Interpretation	P(x)	Q(x)	Formula
I_1	f_1	g_1	T
I_2	f_1	g_2	T
I_3	f_1	g_3	T
I_4	f_1	g_4	F
I_5	f_2	g_1	T
I_6	f_2	g_2	T
I_7	f_2	g_3	T
I_8	f_2	g_4	F
I_9	f_3	g_1	T
I_{10}	f_3	g_2	T
I_{11}	f_3	g_3	T
I_{12}	f_3	g_4	F
I_{13}	f_4	g_1	T
I_{14}	f_4	g_2	T
I_{15}	f_4	g_3	T
I_{16}	f_4	g_4	T

To provide the truth values of each interpretation, follow the following method :

$$\begin{aligned}
 I_1 (T) \quad & \forall x \{ \text{and} \begin{array}{l} \begin{array}{l} x=1(T) f_1(1)(T) \rightarrow \exists x(T) \{ \text{or} \begin{array}{l} x=1g_1(1)(T) \\ x=2g_1(2)(T) \end{array} \} \\ x=2(T) f_1(2)(T) \rightarrow \exists x(T) \{ \text{or} \begin{array}{l} x=1g_1(1)(T) \\ x=2g_1(2)(T) \end{array} \} \end{array} \end{array} \\
 I_2 (T) \quad & \forall x \{ \text{and} \begin{array}{l} \begin{array}{l} x=1(T) f_1(1)(T) \rightarrow \exists x(T) \{ \text{or} \begin{array}{l} x=1g_2(1)(T) \\ x=2g_2(2)(F) \end{array} \} \\ x=2(T) f_1(2)(T) \rightarrow \exists x(T) \{ \text{or} \begin{array}{l} x=1g_2(1)(T) \\ x=2g_2(2)(F) \end{array} \} \end{array} \end{array} \\
 I_4 (F) \quad & \forall x \{ \text{and} \begin{array}{l} \begin{array}{l} x=1(F) f_1(1)(T) \rightarrow \exists x(F) \{ \text{or} \begin{array}{l} x=1g_4(1)(F) \\ x=2g_4(2)(F) \end{array} \} \\ x=2(F) f_1(2)(T) \rightarrow \exists x(F) \{ \text{or} \begin{array}{l} x=1g_4(1)(F) \\ x=2g_4(2)(F) \end{array} \} \end{array} \end{array} \\
 I_8 (F) \quad & \forall x \{ \text{and} \begin{array}{l} \begin{array}{l} x=1(F) f_2(1)(T) \rightarrow \exists x(F) \{ \text{or} \begin{array}{l} x=1g_4(1)(F) \\ x=2g_4(2)(F) \end{array} \} \\ x=2(T) f_2(2)(F) \rightarrow \exists x(F) \{ \text{or} \begin{array}{l} x=1g_4(1)(F) \\ x=2g_4(2)(F) \end{array} \} \end{array} \end{array}
 \end{aligned}$$

b) The truth table of the second formula $\forall x(P(x, y) \wedge \exists xP(x))$.

In this case, we have two predicates and one free variable y.

- We will represent the predicate P(x) by the function f(x),
- The predicate P(x, y) will be represented by the function g(x).

The truth table of P(x) is as follows :

x	P(x)	$f_1(x)$	$f_2(x)$	$f_3(x)$	$f_4(x)$
1		T	T	F	F
2		T	F	T	F

The truth table of P(x,y) is as follows :

x	y	$g_1(x, y)$	$g_2(x, y)$	$g_3(x, y)$	$g_4(x, y)$	$g_5(x, y)$	$g_6(x, y)$	$g_7(x, y)$	$g_8(x, y)$	$g_9(x, y)$
1	1	T	T	T	T	T	T	T	T	F
1	2	T	T	T	T	F	F	F	F	T
2	1	T	T	F	F	T	T	F	F	T
2	2	T	F	T	F	T	F	T	F	T

$g_{10}(x, y)$	$g_{11}(x, y)$	$g_{12}(x, y)$	$g_{13}(x, y)$	$g_{14}(x, y)$	$g_{15}(x, y)$	$g_{16}(x, y)$
F	F	F	F	F	F	F
T	T	T	F	F	F	F
T	F	F	T	T	F	F
F	T	F	T	F	T	F

The overall truth table is as follows :

Interpretation	P(x)	P(x,y)	y	Formula
I_1	f_1	g_1	1	T
I_2	f_1	g_1	2	.
I_3	f_1	g_2	1	.
.	.	.	.	.
.	.	.	.	.
.	.	.	.	.
.	f_1	g_{16}	1	.
.	f_1	g_{16}	2	.
.	.	.	.	.
.	.	.	.	.
.	.	.	.	.
I_{98}	f_4	g_1	2	F
.	.	.	.	.
.	.	.	.	.
.	.	.	.	.

To provide the truth values of each interpretation, follow the following method :

$$I_1 (T) \forall x \{ \text{and}^{x=1(T)g_1(1,1)(T) \wedge \exists x(T) \{ \text{or}^{x=1f_1(1)(T)}_{x=2f_1(2)(T)} \}} \}$$

$$I_{98} (F) \forall x \{ \text{and}^{x=1(F)g_1(1,2)(T) \wedge \exists x(F) \{ \text{or}^{x=1f_4(1)(F)}_{x=2f_4(2)(F)} \}}_{x=2(F)g_1(2,2)(T) \wedge \exists x(F) \{ \text{or}^{x=1f_4(1)(F)}_{x=2f_4(2)(F)} \}} \}$$

Exercise 7 Solution :

a)

$$1) \forall x \forall y A(x, y) \vdash A(x, y)$$

$$1 \vdash \forall x \forall y A(x, y) \quad \text{hyp1}$$

$$2 \vdash \forall x \forall y A(x, y) \longrightarrow \forall y A(x, y) \quad \text{sch}\forall$$

$$3 \vdash \forall y A(x, y) \quad \text{mp } 1, 2$$

$$4 \vdash \forall y A(x, y) \longrightarrow A(x, y) \quad \text{sch}\forall$$

$$5 \vdash A(x, y) \quad \text{mp } 3, 4$$

$$2) \forall x (P(x) \longrightarrow Q(x)), \forall x P(x) \vdash \forall x Q(x)$$

$$1 \vdash \forall x (P(x) \longrightarrow Q(x)) \quad \text{hyp1}$$

$2 \vdash \forall x P(x)$ hyp2
 $3 \vdash \forall x (P(x) \rightarrow Q(x)) \rightarrow (P(x) \rightarrow Q(x))$ sch $\forall$
 $4 \vdash P(x) \rightarrow Q(x)$ mp 1,3
 $5 \vdash \forall x P(x) \rightarrow P(x)$ sch $\forall$
 $6 \vdash P(x)$ mp 2,5
 $7 \vdash Q(x)$ mp 4,6
 $8 \vdash Q(x) \rightarrow (\forall x P(x) \rightarrow Q(x))$ sch 1a
 $9 \vdash \forall x P(x) \rightarrow Q(x)$ mp 7,8
 $10 \vdash \forall x P(x) \rightarrow \forall x Q(x)$ rule $\forall$ from 9
 $11 \vdash \forall x Q(x)$ mp 2,10

3) $P(a), \forall x (P(x) \rightarrow Q(x)) \vdash Q(a)$
 $1 \vdash P(a)$ hyp1
 $2 \vdash \forall x (P(x) \rightarrow Q(x))$ hyp2
 $3 \vdash \forall x (P(x) \rightarrow Q(x)) \rightarrow (P(a) \rightarrow Q(a))$ sch $\forall$
 $4 \vdash P(a) \rightarrow Q(a)$ mp 2,3
 $5 \vdash Q(a)$ mp 1,4

4) $\forall x S(x) \wedge \forall x R(x) \vdash \exists x (S(x) \wedge R(x))$
 $1 \vdash \forall x S(x) \wedge \forall x R(x)$ Hyp1
 $2 \vdash \forall x S(x) \wedge \forall x R(x) \rightarrow \forall x S(x)$ sch 3a we replaced A with $\forall x S(x)$ and B with $\forall x R(x)$
 $3 \vdash \forall x S(x)$ mp 1,2
 $4 \vdash \forall x S(x) \wedge \forall x R(x) \rightarrow \forall x R(x)$ sch 3b we replaced A with $\forall x S(x)$ and B with $\forall x R(x)$
 $5 \vdash \forall x R(x)$ mp 1,4
 $6 \vdash \forall x S(x) \rightarrow S(x)$ sch $\forall$
 $7 \vdash S(x)$ mp 3,6
 $8 \vdash \forall x R(x) \rightarrow R(x)$ sch $\forall$
 $9 \vdash R(x)$ mp 5,8
 $10 \vdash S(x) \rightarrow (R(x) \rightarrow S(x) \wedge R(x))$ sch 2 we replaced A with $S(x)$ and B with $R(x)$
 $11 \vdash R(x) \rightarrow S(x) \wedge R(x)$ mp 7,10
 $12 \vdash S(x) \wedge R(x)$ mp 9,11
 $13 \vdash (S(x) \wedge R(x)) \rightarrow \exists x (S(x) \wedge R(x))$ sch $\exists$
 $14 \vdash \exists x (S(x) \wedge R(x))$ mp 12,13

b)
 $\vdash \forall x P(x) \rightarrow \exists x P(x)$
 $1 \vdash \forall x P(x) \rightarrow P(x)$ sch $\forall$
 $2 \vdash (\forall x P(x) \rightarrow P(x)) \rightarrow ((\forall x P(x) \rightarrow (P(x) \rightarrow \exists x P(x))) \rightarrow (\forall x P(x) \rightarrow \exists x P(x)))$ sch
 1b, we replaced A with $\forall x P(x)$, B with $P(x)$ and C with $\exists x P(x)$
 $3 \vdash (\forall x P(x) \rightarrow (P(x) \rightarrow \exists x P(x))) \rightarrow (\forall x P(x) \rightarrow \exists x P(x))$ mp 1,2
 $4 \vdash P(x) \rightarrow \exists x P(x)$ sch $\exists$
 $5 \vdash (P(x) \rightarrow \exists x P(x)) \rightarrow (\forall x P(x) \rightarrow (P(x) \rightarrow \exists x P(x)))$ sch 1a we replaced A with
 $(P(x) \rightarrow \exists x P(x))$ and B par $\forall x P(x)$
 $6 \vdash (\forall x P(x) \rightarrow (P(x) \rightarrow \exists x P(x)))$ mp 4,5
 $7 \vdash \forall x P(x) \rightarrow \exists x P(x)$ mp 3,6